tracka

Using civic advocacy to reach the underserved community

By Adewole Adejola
What we do?

Over the years, Nigerians in rural communities have had little or no idea of government projects in their communities.

Tracka was established by BudgIT to address critical issues related to government projects

WE TRACK

- Roads
- Health Centers
- Schools
- ...and more
1. Issues surrounding social and economic development in Nigeria.
2. The non-inclusion of citizens in developmental projects
3. Poor execution of the few implemented projects.
4. Abandonment of projects
How we work?

1. IDENTIFY CONSTITUENCY PROJECTS
   Desk officers identify all constituency projects in the Budget and send to Project Tracking Officers on the Field

2. VISIT PROJECT LOCATION
   Project Tracking Officers on the Field visit project location

3. COMMUNITY & ONLINE ENGAGEMENT
   - www.tracka.ng
   - @trackang
   - TownHall Meetings

4. ENGAGEMENT WITH GOVERNMENT & LAW MAKERS
   - We send FOI Requests

STATUS
- Completed
- Uncompleted
- Not Started
- Abandoned
BE AN ACTIVE CITIZEN

1. FIND OUT ABOUT CENTRAL GOVERNMENT PROJECTS IN YOUR CONSTITUENCY
   - Visit BudgIT’s Tracka Website - www.tracka.ng
   - Select your state and find projects around you

2. VISIT PROJECT SITES
   - Take pictures and share on social media platforms - Twitter & Facebook

3. Engage your representative at the house of Representatives
   - Write an email, tweet at or send a letter to your representatives to demand information on government’s projects in your area.

4. ENGAGE MINISTRY/AGENCY IN CHARGE OF PROJECT
   - Know the agency in charge
   - Write an email, tweet at or send a letter to the Ministry or Agency in Charge to inquire Status of the Project

5. REPORT PROJECT AND MONITOR PROGRESS UPDATE
   - Report Issues on Tracka website - www.tracka.ng

#AskQuestions
info@tracka.ng
YOUTH AND WOMEN EMPOWERMENT 
KURA/MADOBI/CARUN MALAM FED CONSTITUENCY, 
KANO STATE.

Amount: N21,000,000

Location: KURA, Kano

By: Yutara Dalla

Category: 2018 FG Constituency Projects

Date: 2 days ago

Report and follow project updates via SMS

Send SMS 8175 [comma] Your Message to 09069482679

See example below.

8175, Yobe road construction is ongoing.

Send To: 09069482679
Tracka enables people to collaborate, track, and give feedback on public projects in their community. Tracka is a project by BudgIT.
Dear Gov @eirufai, this is a Primary School in Abadawa community, Lere LGA, Kaduna State. Despite the N74m provision to build a block of 12 classrooms. There are no classrooms for learning. Pupils are sent home whenever it rains. The pupils learn under the sun.

pic.twitter.com/JWXaKLrHEG

Attn: Gov. @AkinwunmiAmbode kindly find permanent solution to flood issues at Yaba axis. The road is totally messed up.

@TrafficChiefNG @Gidi_Traffic @TrackaNG pic.twitter.com/LNipp1Tzv6
Constituency Projects in Nigeria: Prevaling Trends

1. Empowerment Projects
2. Non Execution of Projects
3. Underdelivery of Projects
4. Use of Sub-standard materials

50% of constituency projects are empowerment projects.

Tracking empowerment projects is a difficult task to civil society: beneficiaries are mainly party loyalists and impact on communities is difficult to measure.

Empowerment project grew between 2016 to 2017.

2016: N41bn
2017: N54bn
### 2016 Empowerment Projects

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State</th>
<th>Allocation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Borno</td>
<td>N3.46bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bauchi</td>
<td>N2.32bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lagos</td>
<td>N2.26bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Osun</td>
<td>N1.99bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kebbi</td>
<td>N1.85bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>kano</td>
<td>N1.64bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>kaduna</td>
<td>N1.47bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gombe</td>
<td>N1.39bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Akwa Ibom</td>
<td>N1.32bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Delta</td>
<td>N1.28bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kogi</td>
<td>N1.27bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kastina</td>
<td>N1.23bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sokoto</td>
<td>N1.22bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taraba</td>
<td>N1.12bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enugu</td>
<td>N1.04bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Niger</td>
<td>N1.04bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Imo</td>
<td>N1.04bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abia</td>
<td>N1.04bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Benue</td>
<td>N923.96m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rivers</td>
<td>N691.91m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ekiti</td>
<td>N584.99m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ebonyi</td>
<td>N553.60m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nasarawa</td>
<td>N539.36m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yobe</td>
<td>N320.67m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bayelsa</td>
<td>N180.00m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oyo</td>
<td>N180.00m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ondo</td>
<td>N179.80m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zamfara</td>
<td>N178.14m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adamawa</td>
<td>N175.58m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anambra</td>
<td>N173.00m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edo</td>
<td>N170.96m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ogun</td>
<td>N169.22m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oltis</td>
<td>N167.62m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jigawa</td>
<td>N162.50m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plateau</td>
<td>N154.46m</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 2017 Empowerment Projects

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State</th>
<th>Allocation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lagos</td>
<td>N7.98bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bauchi</td>
<td>N7.27bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anambra</td>
<td>N7.19bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edo</td>
<td>N7.16bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kastina</td>
<td>N7.11bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ebonyi</td>
<td>N7.09bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gombe</td>
<td>N6.94bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Borno</td>
<td>N6.02bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Akwa Ibom</td>
<td>N5.95bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kaduna</td>
<td>N5.91bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ekiti</td>
<td>N5.77bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taraba</td>
<td>N5.77bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Delta</td>
<td>N5.60bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Osun</td>
<td>N5.56bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kano</td>
<td>N5.56bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kebbi</td>
<td>N5.56bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abia</td>
<td>N5.56bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Benue</td>
<td>N5.56bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rivers</td>
<td>N5.47bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edo</td>
<td>N5.39bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ondo</td>
<td>N5.35bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ogun</td>
<td>N5.29bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sokoto</td>
<td>N5.19bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Benue</td>
<td>N5.15bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bayelsa</td>
<td>N4.94bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adamawa</td>
<td>N4.65bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Niger</td>
<td>N4.03bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ondo</td>
<td>N3.92bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kogi</td>
<td>N3.55bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cross River</td>
<td>N3.10bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nasarawa</td>
<td>N3.08bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jigawa</td>
<td>N2.94bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FCT</td>
<td>N2.51bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plateau</td>
<td>N1.88bn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>kwara</td>
<td>N432.83m</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Constituency Projects in Nigeria: Prevaling Trends

1. Empowerment Projects
   - 189 Abandoned Projects

2. Non Execution of Projects
   - 207 Not Executed

3. Underdelivery of Projects

4. Use of Sub-standard materials

- 213 Ongoing Projects
- 488 Completed Projects
- 216 Unspecified Projects

Total Projects Tracked: 1,313
Constituency Projects in Nigeria: Prevaling Trends

1. Empowerment Projects
2. Non Execution of Projects
3. Underdelivery of Projects
4. Use of Sub-standard materials
Constituency Projects in Nigeria: Prevaling Trends

1. Empowerment Projects
2. Non Execution of Projects
3. Underdelivery of Projects
4. Use of Sub-standard materials

N20m
BOREHOLE CONSTRUCTED ON AN EXISTING WELL

For example, a motorised borehole with 5.5KVA generator in Kebbi North Senatorial district, by Kebbi state Senator Yahaya Abdullahi gulsed N20 million. The contractor used an existing well, constructed a shabby tank and installed a submersible pump in the well instead of the motorised borehole.
Constituency Projects in Nigeria: Prevaling Trends

1. Empowerment Projects
2. Non Execution of Projects
3. Underdelivery of Projects
4. Use of Sub-standard materials

On several occasions, where projects were delivered (whether fully or partially), PTOs and community members both report that some were executed with inferior products, consequently resulting in endangerment of lives, developmental setbacks and further expenditure, due to extra repair and remediation costs for the government.

Community leaders across focus states were of the opinion that this practice stems from contractors aiming to maximise profit by cutting costs, and they are emboldened to do so because often, there are no sanctions from the law, when consequences occur and complaints arise.
Constituency Projects in Nigeria: Prevaling Trends

1. Empowerment Projects
2. Non Execution of Projects
3. Underdelivery of Projects
4. Use of Sub-standard materials
Constituency Projects in Nigeria: Prevaling Trends

4. Use of Sub-standard materials

We observed that the locations of about 216 projects described in the budgetary line items amounting to N1.8 billion remained unspecified, a situation that persists, since the inception of Tracka.

5. Unspecified project locations

For effective project tracking, it is imperative that project locations are detailed in the budget.

6. Contract Inflation

Failure to provide these locations is antithetical to democracy, depriving communities, civil society organisations and auditing bodies of information and opportunities to monitor and ensure proper implementation of the government’s obligations to the people.

7. Lack of Constituency Awareness
Constituency Projects in Nigeria: Prevaling Trends

4. Use of Sub-standard materials

5. Unspecified project locations

6. Contract Inflation

7. Lack of Constituency Awareness

- Realities on the field indicate that inflated costs and pricing of government projects is one of the leading causes of corruption in Nigeria.

- Residents told us overwhelmingly that contractors often happen to be the beneficiaries of developmental projects, rather than the citizens.
Constituency Projects in Nigeria: Prevaling Trends

5. Use of Sub-standard materials

6. Unspecified project locations

7. Contract Inflation

6. Lack of Constituency Awareness

N38m School with no furniture

Students still using their old classroom
Constituency Projects in Nigeria: Prevaling Trends

4. Use of Sub-standard materials

In many of the 643 communities visited more than once, we observed that citizens in rural areas have no idea of constituency projects to be constructed on their streets, much less how these projects are funded.

5. Unspecified project locations

In the most common instances, citizens believed that available projects were gifts from their Representatives, and personally funded.

6. Contract Inflation

This points to an urgent need to create more awareness for citizens, to enable them engage their representatives and seek delivery of public service.

7. Lack of Constituency Awareness

When viewed as a gift, members of the constituency are less likely to demand higher standards, and are accepting of whatever has been offered to them, even though these are actually being paid for through their tax contributions.
Major Highlights:
1. Tax-funded Government Projects Called Donations

Location: Lagos

PTOs tracking the 2017 FG constituency projects report that Representatives within the National Assembly labeled public projects as “donations.”

In Surulere Federal Constituency 1 (Lagos state), we observed that the provision of ambulances budgeted at a value of N51m were, upon purchase and delivery to the respective hospitals, labeled as “donations” from Surulere Representative, Femi Gbajabiamila.
Major Highlights:
1. Tax-funded Government Projects Called Donations

Location: Kebbi State

Similarly, in Kebbi South Senatorial District (Kebbi State), the Federal Government budget provided for the supply of hospital boats in Yauri, at a cost of N175m.

The boats were instead labeled “Donated by Senator Bala Na Allah,” who is the Representative for the area.

We reiterate that constituency projects should not be labeled as donations by community representatives in the National Assembly; this comes off as a malicious attempt at deliberately misinforming their constituents, for selfish political interests.
Major Highlights:
2. Conversion of Public Project to Personal Property

By law, constituency projects are nominated by the Representative, for the benefit of indigenes at grassroots level. It is also a means for citizens to feel the impact of governance in their community.

A line item in the Federal Government Budget detailed the construction of 71 boreholes in the 71 Wards across Kebbi Senatorial District, valued at N710m.

Borehole construction commenced in December in selected wards. However, in Zuru Ward, the borehole was constructed within the personal property of a serving Senator.

This automatically deprives citizens of the opportunity of accessing potable water. This was a case where governance directly failed to alleviate the suffering of a community.
Major Highlights:
3. Wide Disparities in Project Value

Location: Osun, Bauchi, Enugu, Edo, Delta and Lagos States

We report varying amounts were allocated to key states in the National Assembly; Osun, Bauchi, Enugu, Edo, Delta, and Lagos got the highest sums in the 2017 Federal Government budget for constituency projects.

In one instance, the sum of N1b was budgeted for the construction of schools in Kwara central senatorial district in Kwara State, while N200m was allocated to Isoko Federal constituency in Delta for the maintenance of solar streetlights.

Similarly, in Edo state, N500m was allocated to the ‘Rehabilitation and Reconstruction of Otuo-Afuze Road, with a sour to Anchorage Road, Otuo, in Owan East LGA.’ Although N259m was released in relation to this project, at the time this report was filed, community members cited the level of work undertaken as not reflecting the amount disbursed.

In Osun state, most projects were empowerment projects, which are particularly difficult to track, as there is no physical, auditable result.
Recommendations

Open Data of Contract Details: This must be prioritised, to ensure citizen participation in contract awards via the provision of accurate details of all contracts (contractors’ name, government budget benchmark, terms of the agreement, bill of quantity, etc), placed in the public domain. Updated contract information also has the added benefit of enabling government to control incompetence and contract fraud more effectively.

Citizen engagement: Representatives should routinely engage their constituents in the budget-making process, to ensure their needs are captured in annual fiscal plans, in a timely fashion. The fundamental purpose of constituency projects is to ensure rural communities feel the impact of the federal government; therefore their priorities should be reflected in the budget.
Recommendations

Project specification should be more detailed: Project locations should be spelt out, for easy access by citizens and organisations. As noted, in several cases, budget line items identified project titles, specifications and monetary amounts, but failed to establish the actual project location. Unclear locations and other such details mean certain projects are extremely prone to misappropriation of funds and corruption.

Ownership of Contract Award: It appears that lawmakers at the National Assembly are of the belief that they are personally responsible for their constituency projects and thus award and project implementation must be coordinated/micromanaged through their offices. We cite this as improper practice; contract award and project implementation must be coordinated through the relevant federal ministries, as noted within the budget.

Mislabeling of Projects: We recommend that public officials desist from tagging supplied materials and projects with their names for personal glory and political clout; citizens should be aware of the actual sponsor of the project—the Federal Government, as enabled by taxpayers.
We submit that the sum of these few examples from many should be a wake-up call to the devastating effects of Representatives shirking their constitutional responsibilities to the people. Should citizens remain discouraged from exerting their right to demand a delivery of capital projects, Nigeria would have effectively mortgaged her future and perpetuated the suffering that threatens a vast majority of her people.
Thank you for listening!